1

Phonological Recoding in Error detection: A Cross-sectional Study in Beginning Readers of Dutch

4

5 Eva Van Assche, Wouter Duyck & Robert J. Hartsuiker

- 6 Department of Experimental Psychology, Ghent University, Ghent, Belgium
- 7
- 8 Correspondence Address:
- 9 Eva Van Assche (corresponding author)
- 10 Department of Experimental Psychology
- 11 Ghent University
- 12 Henri Dunantlaan 2
- 13 B-9000 Ghent (Belgium)
- 14 E-mail: <u>eva.vanassche@ugent.be</u>
- 15 Tel: 32-9-264-64-05 Fax: 32-9-264-64-96

16 Abstract

- 17 The present cross-sectional study investigated the development of phonological recoding
- 18 in beginning readers of Dutch, using a proofreading task with pseudohomophones and
- 19 control misspellings. In Experiment 1, children in grades 1 to 3 rejected fewer
- 20 pseudohomophones (e.g., *wein*, sounding like *wijn* 'wine') as spelling errors than control
- 21 misspellings (e.g., *wijg*). The size of this pseudohomophone effect was larger in grade 1
- than in grade 2 and did not differ between grades 2 and 3. In Experiment 2, we replicated
- the pseudohomophone effect in beginning readers and we tested how orthographic
 knowledge may modulate this effect. Children in grades 2 to 4 again detected fewer
- 24 knowledge may modulate this effect. Unifiden in grades 2 to 4 again detected lewer 25 pseudohomophones than control misspellings and this effect decreased between grades 2
- and 3 and between grades 3 and 4. The magnitude of the pseudohomophone effect was
- 27 modulated by the development of orthographic knowledge: its magnitude decreased
- 28 much more between grades 2 and 3 for more advanced spellers, than for less advanced
- 29 spellers. The persistence of the pseudohomophone effect across all grades illustrates the
- 30 importance of phonological recoding in Dutch readers. At the same time, the decreasing
- 31 pseudohomophone effect across grades indicates the increasing influence of orthographic
- 32 knowledge as reading develops.

33 Introduction

- 34 One of the most important skills that children learn at school is reading. Skilled readers
- 35 can read without apparent effort and only take a few hundred milliseconds to recognize a
- 36 word. This highly automated reading process depends on the word representations in a
- 37 large mental store (the orthographic lexicon). At the same time, skilled readers also know
- 38 the language's spelling-to-sound conventions very well. Readers can get from print to
- 39 meaning by spelling-to-sound translation or by accessing whole-word orthographic
- 40 representations. These two mechanisms form the basis for the generic dual-route
- 41 architecture for visual word recognition by models in the Dual-Route Cascaded (e.g., [1]
- 42 and the Parallel-Distributed Processing tradition (e.g., [2,3]). One prominent view is the

44 two distinct, but interactive procedures: the lexical and non-lexical routes. In the lexical 45 route, reading relies on the activation of whole-word orthographic and phonological 46 representations. These representations can directly activate semantic representations. 47 Contrary to this lexical retrieval process based on whole-word units, the non-lexical route 48 involves a phonological procedure based on grapheme-phoneme correspondences. It is 49 assumed that these routes interact and that all input words (familiar and unfamiliar 50 (pseudo)words) are processed by both routes in parallel [1]. This reasoning is exemplified 51 in the "two-hoses-filling-a-bucket" concept ([4] according to [5]). 52 53 The connectionist approach of Seidenberg and colleagues (e.g., [2,3]) provides another 54 influential view on visual word recognition. It also involves two procedures to get from 55 print to meaning. One procedure goes directly from orthography to semantics, while the 56 other involves a phonological procedure to achieve the same. Harm and Seidenberg [3] 57 presented a model in which meanings are determined by the cooperative division of labor

Dual-Route Cascaded model [1] according to which visual word recognition proceeds via

- 58 between the direct-visual and phonologically mediated procedures.
- 59

43

60 The two mechanisms of phonological and orthographic processing form the basis of 61 several accounts of word reading development (e.g., [6-11]). For instance, Ehri [6, 7] 62 suggests that English children learn to read words in four phases, starting from pre-63 alphabetic, over partial and full alphabetic, to consolidated alphabetic when increasingly 64 more sight words are retained in memory. Sight word reading (reading from memory) can 65 only be done for words that we have read before and that are consolidated in lexical 66 memory. In Ehri's phase theory, alphabetic knowledge that connects graphemes to 67 phonemes is essential to consolidate words in lexical memory. Share [9-11] rather 68 assumes that the act of phonological recoding (connecting graphemes to phonemes) is 69 essential to obtain orthographic knowledge. The self-teaching hypothesis [9, 12, 13] 70 suggests that phonological recoding, whether overt or covert, is the central process by 71 which beginning readers acquire word-specific knowledge. Each successful recoding 72 provides the opportunity to build up whole-word orthographic knowledge that provides 73 the foundation of skilled word reading. This implies that at a certain point, a child will 74 read the most frequent words via primarily orthographic recognition, whereas less 75 common words are processed phonologically (i.e., item-based phonological recoding 76 [9,14]).

77

78 These theoretical views all posit that phonology plays a prominent role in reading and 79 word comprehension. Also, they assume that children first rely on the recoding of 80 graphemes to phonemes to access semantic word representations before obtaining and 81 using orthographic knowledge of whole-word representations in word comprehension. 82 However, other factors, such as cross-language differences in orthographic consistency 83 and the individual reader's degree of orthographic knowledge, may determine the extent 84 and speed to which phonological recoding affects word reading in beginning readers. In 85 this respect, it is important to note that the majority of existing studies on phonological 86 recoding in reading were conducted in English, which is a relatively opaque language. Accordingly, there is an overreliance on the English orthography in models of word 87 88 reading acquisition as noted by Share [15]. It is worthwhile therefore to examine

89 phonological recoding in a variety of languages as benchmarks for future developments

90 in theoretical models of reading. It may be that reading in more transparent languages,

- 91 such as Dutch, may boost phonological recoding in early reading stages, or speed up the
- 92 development of other reading strategies, following the logic of Share's [11] self-teaching
- 93 hypothesis. Furthermore, it is worthwhile to examine whether children who already
- 94 acquired orthographic knowledge can also use this knowledge efficiently in a reading
- 95 task such as proofreading.

Cross-language differences 96

97 English studies have shown that phonological recoding strongly influences reading in 98 beginning readers. For instance, in a study by Doctor and Coltheart [16], English-reading 99 children aged six to ten years were asked to judge the meaningfulness of sentences. The 100 youngest group erroneously accepted meaningless sentences that were meaningful when 101 phonologically recoded in most of the cases (e.g., "She blue <blev> up the balloon"; "I 102 have *noe* <no> time"), whereas they did not accept meaningless sentences that remained 103 meaningless when phonologically recoded (e.g., "She know up the balloon"; "I have bloo 104 time"). This pseudohomophone effect became smaller as reading proficiency (age) 105 increased. Doctor and Coltheart concluded that beginning readers rely to a great extent on 106 phonological recoding, and evolve towards using visual representations of words with

- 107 increasing reading skill.
- 108

109 A strong reliance on phonological recoding in beginning readers has also been found in

110 studies in other languages (e.g., French (e.g., [17,18]) and German (e.g., [19,20]). For

instance, the longitudinal study of Sprenger-Charolles et al. [18] investigated the 111 112 development of phonological and orthographic processing in French-reading children

113

- from grade 1 to the end of grade 4. They used the semantic categorization task in which a 114 higher number of false positive responses on pseudohomophones (e.g., rouje for the word
- 115 rouge 'grey' in the category color) than on controls is interpreted as a marker of

116 phonological processing (cf. [21,22]). From the end of grade 1, pseudohomophone

117 nonwords yielded more false positive responses than controls. The authors hypothesized

- 118 that the pseudohomophone effect should gradually disappear, but phonological recoding
- 119 appeared to have a long lasting influence on performance in the semantic categorization
- 120 task for these French-reading children. A smaller pseudohomophone effect was only
- 121 observed from the end of grade 3 on.
- 122

123 Similar results were obtained by Grainger, Lété, Bertand, Dufau, and Ziegler [23]. They

124 tested French children in the first to fifth grade and a group of adult readers using a

125 lexical decision task. Grainger et al. tested phonological recoding using

126 pseudohomophones (e.g., *trane*) and orthographic controls (e.g., *trand*), whereas direct

127 whole-word orthographic processing was tested using transposed letter nonwords (e.g.,

128 *talbe*) and orthographic controls (e.g., *tarpe*). The results revealed distinct developmental

129 trajectories for the pseudohomophone and transposed-letter effects. Pseudohomophone 130

effects decreased in size, but never disappeared completely, as reading level increased, 131

whereas transposed-letter effects initially increased and then diminished. This implies

132 that beginning readers primarily read via phonological recoding and that this strong reliance on phonological recoding decreases as reading skill and orthographic knowledge

134 develops.

135

136 Many studies have investigated the involvement of phonological recoding in languages 137 such as English or French (e.g., [18, 19, 23-28], but relatively few studies have 138 investigated phonological recoding in beginning readers of Dutch, although this language 139 is quite often studied in the adult psycholinguistic literature. The English language has a 140 deep orthography with complex grapheme-phoneme correspondences and phoneme-141 grapheme correspondences, so that a letter may be mapped on different sounds (e.g., the 142 a in have vs. that in wave), while the same sound may be represented orthographically by 143 different graphemes (e.g., the phonetic form [u] in *blue* vs. that in *blew*). But note that 144 there is a high level of consistency at the morphological level [29]. Other languages also 145 have inconsistent grapheme-phoneme correspondences (e.g., Danish), while others are 146 consistent in this respect (e.g., Italian, Dutch, French, German, Spanish). Similarly, in 147 some languages a phoneme can have several spellings (e.g., French, Dutch, Hebrew), 148 while in other languages (e.g., Italian) a phoneme is always spelled in the same way. The 149 language under study here, Dutch, is a fairly regular language, although Dutch phoneme-150 grapheme correspondences are much less consistent (e.g., the verbs leiden 'lead' and 151 *lijden* 'suffer' have the same pronunciation) than grapheme-phoneme correspondences. 152 Bosman, Vonk, and van Zwam [30] report that pronunciation consistency at the body-153 rhyme level (i.e., corresponding to what is left of a monosyllabic word after removing the 154 initial consonant or consonant cluster) is 84.5% whereas spelling consistency is 36.8%. 155 When spelling an ambiguous phoneme-grapheme correspondence, the speller needs to 156 know the whole-word orthographic form (e.g., [ɛi] in geit vs. spijt) (for a detailed 157 description of Dutch orthography, see [31]). Still, Dutch has higher sound-spelling 158 consistencies than French or English. For instance, Bosman et al. [30] reported higher 159 spelling consistency levels at the rhyme-body level in Dutch (36.8%) than in French 160 (2.8%). Because of these differences, it is interesting to examine whether phonological 161 recoding in reading in Dutch, and its evolution as a function of proficiency, may differ 162 from other languages.

163

Early studies of Reitsma [32, 33] examined the role of orthographic knowledge in Dutch children's reading. Reitsma [32] showed that beginning readers (7 and 8 years old) can acquire word-specific knowledge quite rapidly; even a few presentations appeared to affect subsequent reading. Although only orthographic learning was examined, Reitsma assumed that beginning readers still rely on phonological recoding to pronounce a word, even though orthographic knowledge also becomes available in word recognition.

170

171 A later study of Bosman and de Groot [21] explicitly focused on phonological recoding

in the reading of Dutch children in the first grade of elementary school (mean age: 7

173 years, 4 months). They used a variety of silent reading tasks such as proofreading, lexical

174 decision, and semantic categorization. The critical stimuli were again pseudohomophones

175 (e.g., *wein*, sounding like *wijn* 'wine') and control misspellings (e.g., *wijg*). In the

176 proofreading task, children detected fewer pseudohomophones than control misspellings.

177 In the lexical decision task, they erroneously accepted more pseudohomophone

178 misspellings as words than control misspellings. Similarly, in the semantic categorization

179 task, they falsely accepted more pseudohomophone misspellings as category members

180 than control misspellings. Bosman and de Groot's results show a strong influence of

181 phonological recoding in beginning readers of Dutch (first grade readers), but its

- 182 development remains an open question.
- 183

184 A study by Martens and de Jong [34] using the word length effect as another marker 185 effect for phonological processing provided a first investigation of this issue. This word 186 length effect entails that length does not affect reading speed for high frequent words 187 (indicating a lexical reading procedure), whereas longer pseudowords are recognized 188 slower than short pseudowords (indicating a sub-lexical reading procedure). They tested 189 Dutch-reading children in grades 2 and 4 in a lexical decision task. The results indicate 190 that younger children mainly relied on a sub-lexical reading strategy because the second 191 graders were affected by word length when performing lexical decisions, whereas the 192 older fourth graders showed no such word length effect. However, the more extended 193 developmental trajectory of these Dutch beginning readers remains an open question.

194 This will be a key issue for the present paper.

195 Orthographic knowledge

196 Several studies (e.g., [17, 21]) suggest that individual readers' orthographic knowledge 197 and reading skill may determine the extent to which phonological recoding affects 198 reading in children. Sprenger-Charolles et al. [17] studied French-reading children from 199 kindergarten until the end of grade 2 to examine phonological recoding in a silent reading 200 task and to examine the role of phonological recoding in the construction of the 201 orthographic lexicon. The use of phonological recoding was assessed in a semantic 202 categorization task with pseudohomophone (e.g., pome derived from pomme for the food 203 category) and visual foils (e.g., *pomne*). Based on the results of an orthographic choice 204 task at the end of grade 2, pupils were categorized into either an expert or a poor spellers 205 group. There were no differences in the processing of homophone and visual foils at the 206 middle of grade 1 between both groups. However, at the end of grade 1, only the future 207 expert spellers showed a pseudohomophone effect (i.e., they correctly classified 208 pseudohomophone misspellings as non-exemplars less often than control misspellings) in 209 the semantic categorization task, while both groups showed effects at the end of grade 2. 210 Sprenger-Charolles et al. suggested that the use of phonological mediation in early 211 reading acquisition is a mechanism allowing readers to construct an orthographic lexicon 212 (cf. [9]). However, the results of the poor speller group should be handled with caution as 213 these results were based on only 7 subjects (compared to 19 children in the expert speller group).

- 214
- 215

216 The Dutch study of Bosman and de Groot [21] discussed earlier also compared the 217 performance of more and less advanced readers. They used the results of this comparison, 218 and the results of the influence of base-word frequency, to test the verification hypothesis 219 (e.g., [22, 35, 36]). This hypothesis assumes that a pseudohomophone can activate the

220 spelling of the base word and that orthographic knowledge can be used to verify the

221 spelling of the presented pseudohomophone. It provides an alternative interpretation for

the effect of reading skill as given in other studies (e.g., [16]). For instance, Doctor and 222

223 Coltheart [16] suggest that better readers differentially use phonological recoding in word 224 processing with a more frequent use of a direct lexical access procedure. Bosman and de 225 Groot showed that in the majority of the experimental tasks, the more advanced readers 226 detected more pseudohomophones as incorrect words than the less advanced readers did, 227 but both groups scored equally on the control misspellings. They attributed these 228 differences between more and less advanced readers to a more efficient spelling 229 verification process in more advanced readers. Interestingly, the results also showed that 230 spelling verification is not yet stable in beginning readers, as the performance of the more 231 advanced readers dropped to that of the less advanced ones when the critical stimuli in 232 the proofreading task were presented in stories as opposed to lists of unconnected words. 233 Similarly, in the semantic categorization task, there was no effect of reading level. These 234 results show that the task context can provide constraints that work against successful 235 verification. With regard to the role of base-word frequency, it was assumed that the 236 spellings of high-frequency words are more available to verification than those of low-237 frequency words, but the base-word frequency manipulation did not yield any effects. 238 Nevertheless, these results show that individual reading skill influences reading

239 acquisition.

240 The present study

241 Based on this literature overview, the present study has the following aims. In

- 242 Experiment 1, we aimed at investigating the development of phonological recoding in 243 beginning readers of Dutch. We used the pseudohomophone effect in the proofreading 244 task (cf. [21]) to investigate phonological recoding in silent word reading in different age
- groups (children in primary school, grades 1 to 3, aged 7 to 9). Given that the reading 245
- 246 acquisition accounts of Share [9, 10] and Ehri [6, 7] predict that phonology plays an
- 247 essential role in beginning reading, we predict that Dutch children will detect fewer 248 pseudohomophone misspellings than controls. With increasing reading experience and
- 249 increasing orthographic knowledge, we expect that the performance on
- 250 pseudohomophone misspellings will improve, but not equal performance for control
- 251 misspellings following similar findings in other languages such as English [24, 26] or
- 252 French [18]. Furthermore, reading in the Dutch language, which has a higher sound-
- 253 spelling consistency than French or English (e.g., [30, 37]), may boost phonological
- 254 recoding in early reading stages so that, following the logic of Share's [11] self-teaching
- 255 hypothesis, a strong reliance on phonological recoding may lead to the fast development 256 of orthographic knowledge.
- 257

258 Experiment 2 aimed at investigating how individual's degree of orthographic knowledge 259 modulates phonological recoding in reading. Using the same proofreading task as in 260 Experiment 1, we tested different age groups of more and less advanced spellers (children in primary school, grades 2 to 4, aged 8 to 10). We predicted weaker effects of 261 262 phonological recoding for more advanced spellers, as reflected by a smaller

- 263 pseudohomophone effect.
- 264

265 In addition to the proofreading task in Experiments 1 and 2, an orthographic choice task

- 266 (Experiment 1) (cf. [18, 21]) or spelling test (Experiment 2) was used to test whether
- 267 children actually knew the spelling of the words from which the pseudohomophones were
- 268 derived. An important methodologically new aspect of our study was that the results of

269 the orthographic choice task were used to discard items from the proofreading data for 270 which participants simply did not know the correct spelling. So, any effect of 271 phonological recoding in the proofreading task indicates the strong impact of 272 phonological recoding because children actually knew the words' spellings in the 273 orthographic choice task or spelling test. This procedure of removing unknown words 274 from analyses was not adopted in the previous studies by Bosman and de Groot [21] and 275 Sprenger-Charolles et al. [17,18] and this could have biased their results because readers 276 may by definition only rely on phonological recoding if the correct spelling of a word is 277 not known. Importantly, Starr and Fleming [28] have shown that removing commonly 278 misspelled homophones from the analyses resulted in the reduction of homophone 279 confusion error rates by approximately half in their Experiment 4. If children did not 280 know the correct spelling of a given target, the false acceptance of the derived 281 pseudohomophone as a real word in a semantic categorization task could have originated 282 from the activation of a (wrong) orthographic lexical code, and not necessarily from

283 phonological recoding.

284 Experiment 1

285 <u>Method</u>

286 Participants

287 Fifty-four children of a primary school in Eastern Flanders, Belgium, participated: 20 288 children (of which 10 female) of grade 1 (mean age: 6 years, 10 months), 17 (10 females) 289 of grade 2 (mean age: 8 years) and 17 (9 females) of grade 3 (mean age: 8 years, 8 290 months). Written informed consent was received from all children's parents and the study 291 was approved by the local ethical committee at the Ghent Faculty of Psychology and 292 Educational Sciences. The children were all native speakers of Dutch who received 293 formal reading instruction from around six years when they attended the first grade. In 294 Belgium, children start the first grade in September based on their date of birth year. At 295 the time of testing, they had received about 25 weeks of formal reading and writing 296 instruction.

297

All children received the same reading curriculum *Taalsignaal* (Wolters Plantyn). This specific reading and language method is mandated by the school, but not by the

300 government. In Belgium, schools can choose freely which textbooks they use on the

301 condition that the textbooks comply with the final attainment levels for each grade

302 mandated by the government. The *Taalsignaal* books are used in every grade and offer a

303 general framework which is used for learning to read, write, listen and speak. This means

that children of grades 2 and 3 had been instructed according to the same method (and

teacher) when they were in grade 1. There were no significant differences between grades

306 on the mean writing and spelling report scores of the month before testing as shown by an 307 independent samples t-test (p > .16). This indicates the comparability of the three age

308 groups, excluding base proficiency confounds effects when comparing grades.

309

310 Reading didactics in grade 1 start by learning to read some simple words as a small

311 vocabulary (e.g., the names Leen, Rik, Mop, Jan, and the words mus 'sparrow', ik 'I', zie

312 'see', *en* 'and', *klas* 'class', *muur* 'wall', *raam* 'window'). At the same time, children

313 learn the sound of each letter individually. So, early reading didactics both relies on

314 whole-word forms and on converting letters to phonemes.

315 Stimuli

326 327

316 We selected twelve monosyllabic base words with a mean length of 4.3 letters (SD =317 0.65) from the first three reading books of the first grade. Children of the first grade were 318 instructed in reading and spelling the words in these books and were all proficient in 319 reading the books. For each base word, a pseudohomophone and a control misspelling 320 were created. The pseudohomophones shared the phonology of the base word, in contrast 321 with the visual control mispellings. We adopted eight base words and their corresponding 322 pseudohomophones and control misspellings from the stimuli of Bosman and de Groot 323 [21]. This increases comparability across (Dutch) studies. In all of the selected base 324 words, a particular phoneme can be mapped to several graphemes. Examples of these 325 mappings are presented in Table 1.

<Insert Table 1 about here>

To ensure that any effect of our phonological manipulation was not confounded with visual similarity between the nonword and the base word, it was essential to control this parameter across conditions. Therefore, we used the Orthographic Similarity (OS) index of Van Orden [22] to check orthographic similarity between pseudohomophones and base words on the one hand, and between control misspellings and base words on the other. This index ranges on a scale from 0 to 1, where 0 indicates no orthographic similarity

between the items and 1 full orthographic overlap.¹ Mean OS between $(M_{10}, 0.07)$ did not difference in the second of the second second

pseudohomophones and base words (M = 0.68, SD = 0.07) did not differ significantly from mean OS between control misspellings and base words (M = 0.70, SD = 0.06) as shown by a paired samples t-test (p > 0.28). Thus, pseudohomophones and controls were equally 'wordlike', relative to the base word. Furthermore, the pseudohomophones and control misspellings did not differ from each other with respect to word length (number of letters), neighbourhood size [38] and bigram frequency (another measure of word likeness of letter strings in a given language, see [39]) (all paired samples t-test ts < 1).

343 These variables were computed using the WordGen stimulus generation software [39], on

344 the basis of the CELEX lexical database [40]. This matching procedure ensured that the

345 critical difference between pseudohomophones and controls is the fact that

346 pseudohomophones, although not written as real words, do sound like real words. The

347 base words, pseudohomophone and control misspellings are listed in the Appendix.

348

Two lists of 60 items each were created. Each list contained the same 48 correctly spelled monosyllabic filler words (similar word length, M = 4.2 letters, SD = 0.72), also selected

¹ Van Orden [22:p. 196] defines graphemic similarity (GS) between two letter strings as GS = 10([(50F + 30V + 10C)/A] + 5T + 27B + 18E) with F = number of pairs of adjacent letters in the same order, shared by pairs, V = number of pairs of adjacent letters in reverse order, shared by pairs, C = number of single letters shared b word pairs, A = average number of letters in two word pairs, T = ratio of shorter word to longer word, B = if first two letters are the same B = 1 else B = 0, E = if last two letters are the same E = 1 else E = 0. Then, Van Orden [22] calculates Orthographic Similarity by determining the ratio between the GS of word 1 with itself and the GS of word 2.

- 351 from the first three reading books of the first grade. Additionally, each list contained 6
- 352 pseudohomophone and 6 control misspellings of the same pair (so that each child saw
- both the pseudohomophone and control misspelling of a pair). Stimulus lists were
- 354 presented in two blocks of 30 trials to avoid concentration issues for the children in grade
- 355 1.

356 Procedure

The written test was administered simultaneously to all the children of a class. Children could not see each other's forms. Instructions emphasized to read the page very carefully and to mark each misspelling (both nonwords and wrongly spelled words) they came across. We asked the children to pretend to be a teacher correcting lists of words. Instructions were repeated several times and the children had the opportunity to ask for clarification before the experiment started.

363

Each child received the first and second block of one of the two stimulus lists. The first
and second block of each main list contained the same correctly spelled filler words.
Children who sat next to each other received different lists. Between blocks, there was a

367 short break of about half an hour. After the completion of the second block of the

368 proofreading task, all children completed an orthographic choice task, in which each

369 pseudohomophone and base word pair was presented on a sheet of paper. The children

370 were instructed to mark the incorrectly spelled item from each pair.

371 *Results*

372 Orthographic choice task results

373 Accuracy was analyzed in analyses of variance (ANOVAs) with Grade (three levels: 374 grade 1, 2, and 3) as the independent variable. Analyses were carried out with 375 participants (F_1) and items (F_2) as the random variables. The results showed that most 376 children knew the spelling of the base words. Mean accuracy was 0.78 (SD = 0.19) in the 377 first grade, 0.93 (SD = 0.09) in the second grade and 0.95 (SD = 0.11) in the third grade. 378 Children performed significantly above chance in each grade (all ps < .001). In grade 1 379 however, there were 4 children who were performing at chance level. There was one item 380 for which scores were lower than chance level in grade 1 (base word koud). Accuracy 381 scores improved between grades $[F_1(2,51) = 8.61, p < .001; F_2(2,22) = 6.85, p < .01].$ 382 Planned comparisons showed that the improvement was significant between the first and 383 second grade $[F_1(1,51) = 10.60, p < .01; F_2(1,11) = 6.06, p < .05]$ but not between the

- second grade $[F_1(1,51) = 10.00, p < .01; F_2(1,11)]$
- 384 second and third grade [Fs < 1].

385 Proofreading results

An ANOVA was run with Grade (three levels: grade 1, 2, and 3) and Word type (two

387 levels: pseudohomophone vs. control) as the independent variables, and accuracy as the

388 dependent variable. For each child and stimulus, we verified whether the correct spelling

389 of that specific word was known by the child (as determined in the orthographic choice

task). If this was not the case, the pseudohomophone and its corresponding control

391 misspelling were removed from the data (cf. [28]). Following this procedure, 25% of

trials were removed in grade 1, 11% in grade 2, and 4% in grade 3. Analyses were carried out with participants (F_1) and items (F_2) as the random variables. Participant and item means of the proportion correctly identified misspellings were calculated. Mean accuracy by Word type and Grade is presented in Figure 1.

<Insert Figure 1 about here>

398 399 Performance of the children improved between grades, as indicated by a significant main 400 effect of Grade $[F_1(2,51) = 25.54, p < .001; F_2(2,44) = 32.82, p < .001]$. The main effect 401 of Word type was also significant $[F_1(1,51) = 59.87, p < .001; F_2(1,22) = 58.91, p < .001; F_2(1,22) = 58.91, p < .001; F_2(1,22) = 58.91, p < .001; F_2(1,22) = .001; F_2(1,22); F_2(1,22) = .001; F_2(1,22); F_2(1,$ 402 .001]. Control misspellings were detected more often than pseudohomophone 403 misspellings. This pseudohomophone effect was significant in each grade: grade 1 404 $[F_1(1,51) = 69.87, p < .001; F_2(1,22) = 81.09, p < .001];$ grade 2 $[F_1(1,51) = 8.37, p < .001]$ 405 $.01; F_2(1,22) = 8.41, p < .01];$ grade 3 $[F_1(1,51) = 6.07, p < .05; F_2(1,11) = 9.96, p < .01].$ 406 Importantly, there was a significant interaction between Grade and Word type $[F_1(2,51) =$ 407 9.41, p < .001; $F_2(2,44) = 14.22$, p < .001]. Differences in detecting pseudohomophone 408 and control misspellings were more pronounced in the first grade (0.29 vs. 0.84) than in 409 the second or third grade (0.71 vs. 0.92 and 0.81 vs. 0.99, respectively). Planned 410 comparisons showed that the pseudohomophone effect was significantly stronger in the 411 first than in the second grade $[F_1(1,51) = 12.53, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 1.20; F_2(1,22) = 18.02, p < .001, d = 18.02, p < .001,$ 412 .001, d = 1.81]. The planned comparison between the second and the third grade was not 413 significant [Fs < 1].

414

397

Taken together, the results from Experiment 1 show that in each grade, children detected more control misspellings than pseudohomophone misspellings. This pseudohomophone

417 effect was more pronounced for children in the first than in the second grade, but it did

- 418 not decrease through grade 3. An orthographic choice task, on the basis of which spelling
- 419 errors were filtered out from the main task, ensured that these effects were not

420 confounded with insufficient spelling knowledge of the base words.

421 Experiment 2

422 To examine the role of increasing orthographic knowledge on the pseudohomophone

423 effect, Experiment 2 was conducted in which more and less advanced spellers in grades

424 2, 3, and 4 were tested. In each grade, we split the group into children with below average

425 and above average orthographic knowledge based on their spelling scores. As readers

426 become more proficient, they have more word-specific knowledge and they grow less

427 dependent on phonological processes. The prediction follows that more advanced spellers

428 should detect more pseudohomophone misspellings than less advanced spellers, as they

- 429 have better orthographic knowledge.
- 430

431 Next to this main theoretical objective, conducting an additional experiment allowed us

to replicate the decrease in pseudohomophone effects with age while improving the

433 methodology in several ways. First, even though filtering out unknown words in the

434 proofreading analyses, based on the orthographic choice task, already provided a

435 methodological improvement compared to previous studies that did not remove unknown

436 words, children who were unsure about the spelling, would still have the correct item

- 437 50% of the time by guessing. We therefore used a straightforward spelling test as a
- 438 measure of orthographic knowledge in Experiment 2 (cf. [16, 28]). Second, the
- 439 orthographic choice task was administered right after the second part of the proofreading
- task and although this was also the case in other studies (e.g., [17, 18, 21]), this might
- 441 have influenced response rates because subjects could be primed by the presence of the
- stimuli in the proofreading lists. Therefore, in Experiment 2, the spelling test was
- 443 administered several hours after the proofreading task. Also, children had to proofread
- 444 lists that contained all the pseudohomophones and control words, while participants only 445 saw half of the stimuli in Experiment 1. Finally, larger subject groups were used in order
- 446 to split up the children of each grade in a group of more and less advanced spellers.

447 <u>Method</u>

448 Participants

449 Eighty-three further children of the same primary school of Experiment 1 participated: 21 450 children (of which 11 females) of grade 2 (mean age: 7 years, 7 months), 28 (18 females) of grade 3 (mean age: 8 years, 7 months), and 34 (19 females) of grade 4 (mean age: 9 451 452 years, 7 months). We obtained written informed consent from all children's parents. The 453 children were all native speakers of Dutch and were instructed according to the same 454 curricula as the children of Experiment 1. The children of grade 2 had received 37 weeks 455 of formal reading and writing instruction in grade 1 and 9 weeks in grade 2. Children of 456 grade 1 could not be included in this experiment because they did not know enough 457 words that could be used to form a variety of pseudohomophones. In each grade, a group of more and less advanced spellers was formed based on a median 458 459 split on the spelling scores of the first month courses (testing was done beginning of

- 460 November, so we used the scores on the school report of October). This way, children of
 461 each grade were divided into a group of children with below and above average
- 462 orthographic knowledge.
- 463

464 In order to demonstrate the comparability of the children across grades, we compared the 465 scores on a normed and standardized test for spelling and mathematics (in Dutch:

- 466 *Leerlingvolgsysteem*). This test measures a child's learning progress and is administered
- 467 to each grade at the beginning, middle and end of the school year. This way, it is tested
- 468 whether each child in each grade reached the attainment goals that are specified for that
- 469 specific grade. These attainment goals have to be reached by all schools in Belgium. We
- 470 compared the mean scores on spelling and mathematics on the last test. The results
- 471 showed no significant differences between grades as shown by an independent samples t-472 test (p > .31). Similarly, there were no significant differences in spelling scores across
- 472 test (p > .51). Similarly, there were no significant differences in spelling scores across 473 grades (p > .53). These results showed that the children in each grade reached the
- 473 attainment goals and therefore, the comparability of the children's scholastic abilities
- 475 across grades.

476 Stimuli

- 477 The 12 pseudohomophone-control pairs of Experiment 1 were used again, together with
- 478 72 fillers words (similar length, M = 4.36 letters, SD = 0.81). Contrary to Experiment 1,
- 479 we now presented all pseudohomophones and controls to each subject. We presented the

- 480 stimulus list in two separate blocks of 48 stimuli, to avoid concentration issues. Each
- 481 block contained 6 pseudohomophones and 6 control misspellings of different base words
- 482 and 36 fillers.

483 Procedure

- 484 The proofreading test was administered simultaneously to all the children of a class. They
- 485 could not see each other's forms and children who were sitting next to each other
- 486 received different lists. Instructions were the same as in Experiment 1. Between
- 487 proofreading the two lists, there was a short break of about an hour.
- 488 To check the orthographic knowledge of the children, a spelling test of the 12 base words
- 489 was administered approximately 3 to 4 hours after completion of the second proofreading
- 490 block. Each base word was spoken out loud and children wrote down every word.

491 *Results*

492 Spelling results

493 We analyzed spelling accuracy in ANOVAs with participants (F_1) and items (F_2) as the 494 random variables. The results showed that most children could write the words down 495 correctly. Only words that were spelled entirely correctly (not just the target grapheme) 496 were calculated as a correct response. No words had to be excluded because of non-497 readable writing. Mean accuracy was 0.68 in the second grade, 0.93 in the third grade, 498 and 0.98 in the fourth grade. An ANOVA with Grade (three levels: grade 2, 3, and 4) and 499 Orthographic knowledge (two levels: more and less advanced) as the independent 500 variables indicated that accuracy scores improved between grades $[F_1(2,77) = 52.52, p < 10^{-10}]$ 501 .001; $F_2(2,22) = 19.83$, p < .001]. Also, more advanced spellers had higher scores than 502 less advanced spellers $[F_1(1,77) = 19.12, p < .001; F_2(1,11) = 15.61, p < .001]$. Most 503 importantly, the interaction between these two factors was significant $[F_1(2,77) = 9.01, p]$ 504 <.001; $F_2(2,22) = 9.99$, p < .001]. This interaction originated from the fact that more 505 advanced spellers (M = 0.80) scored significantly better than less advanced spellers (M =506 0.55) in the second grade $[F_1(1,77) = 28.52, p < .001; F_2(1,11) = 13.69, p < .001]$. In 507 grade 3, this difference between more (M = 0.96) and less advanced spellers (M = 0.89) 508 was much smaller and only significant in the analysis by items $[F_1(1,77) = 2.55, p = .11,;$ 509 $F_2(1,11) = 5.86, p < .05$]. No differences between groups (both M = .98) were observed in 510 grade 4. A graph of the interaction and mean scores for more and less advanced spellers 511 is presented in Figure 2.

- 512
- 513

<Insert Figure 2 about here>

514 *Proofreading results*

515 An ANOVA was run with Grade (three levels: grade 2, 3, and 4), Word type (two levels:

516 pseudohomophone vs. control), and Orthographic knowledge (two levels: more and less

advanced) as the independent variables. For each child and base word, we verified

518 whether the correct spelling was written down in the spelling test. If this was not the case,

- 519 the pseudohomophone and its corresponding control misspelling were removed from the
- 520 data. Following this procedure, 32% of the trials were removed in grade 2, 7% in grade 3,

521 and 2% in grade 4. Subject and item means of the proportion correctly identified 522 misspellings were calculated. Mean accuracy by Word type, Grade and Orthographic 523 knowledge is depicted in Figure 3. 524 525 <Insert Figure 3 about here> 526 527 The analysis yielded significant main effects of Word type $[F_1(1,77) = 171.79, p < .001;$ 528 $F_2(1,20) = 93.52, p < .001$, Grade $[F_1(2,77) = 33.60, p < .001; F_2(2,40) = 80.36, p < .001]$ 529 .001], and Orthographic knowledge $[F_1(1,77) = 21.94, p < .001; F_2(1,20) = 80.53, p < .001]$ 530 .001]. Also, there were significant interactions between Word type and Grade $[F_1(2,77) =$ 531 29.50, p < .001; $F_2(2,40) = 44.07$, p < .001], and between Word type and Orthographic 532 knowledge $[F_1(1,77) = 8.33, p < .01; F_2(1,20) = 18.33, p < .001]$. Most importantly, there 533 was a significant three-way interaction of Word type, Grade, and Orthographic 534 knowledge $[F_1(2,77) = 2.94, p = .06; F_2(2,40) = 8.18, p < .01]$. This interaction is 535 depicted in Figure 3 and showed that the pseudohomophone effect decreased much more 536 between grades 2 and 3 for more advanced spellers, than for less advanced spellers 537 $[F_1(1,77) = 4.83, p < .05; F_2(1,20) = 4.21, p = .05]$. More advanced spellers already 538 performed at the same level in grade 3 as in grade 4 [Fs < 1], whereas less advanced 539 spellers showed a decreasing pseudohomophone effect between grades 3 and 4 $[F_1(1,77)]$ 540 $= 9.25, p < .01; F_2(1,20) = 22.85, p < .001].$ 541 542 Planned comparisons showed a strong pseudohomophone effect in grade 2 for more 543 advanced $[F_1(1,77) = 75.17, p < .001; F_2(1,20) = 122.07, p < .001]$, and for less advanced spellers $[F_1(1,77) = 75.48, p < .001; F_2(1,20) = 55.07, p < .001]$. Strong 544 545 pseudohomophone effects were also observed for less advanced spellers in grade 3 546 $[F_1(1,77) = 48.51, p < .001; F_2(1,20) = 47.17, p < .001]$. The effect for more advanced 547 spellers in grade 3 was only significant in the analysis by items $[F_1(1,77) = 2.95, p = .09;$ 548 $F_2(1,20) = 8.18, p < .01$]. Indeed, the pseudohomophone effect was stronger for less 549 advanced than for more advanced spellers in grade 3 $[F_1(1,77) = 13.77, p < .001;$ 550 $F_2(1,20) = 25.92, p < .001$]. In grade 4, the pseudohomophone effect was significant for 551 less advanced spellers $[F_1(1,77) = 9.92, p < .01; F_2(1,20) = 15.59, p < .001]$, and for more 552 advanced spellers in the item analysis $[F_1(1,77) = 2.21, p = .14; F_2(1,20) = 4.21, p = .05]$. 553 The test for a stronger pseudohomophone effect for less advanced than for more 554 advanced spellers in grade 4 was only significant in the analysis by items $[F_1(1,77) =$ 555 $1.38, p = .24; F_2(1,20) = 9.00, p < .01].$ 556 557 In sum, the results of Experiment 2 show that, as in Experiment 1, fewer 558 pseudohomophones were detected than control misspellings, providing further support 559 for the important role of phonological recoding in proofreading. Pseudohomophone effects were most pronounced in grade 2, and then gradually decreased, but not 560

561 completely disappeared, in grades 3 and 4. Moreover, this pseudohomophone effect was

562 modulated by the degree of orthographic knowledge of children. Although there was no

563 difference in the size of the pseudohomophone effect between more and less advanced

564 spellers in grade 2, this pseudohomophone effect was much stronger for less advanced

than for more advanced spellers in grade 3. From grade 3 on, more advanced spellers

already reached the same level as in grade 4. Less advanced spellers reached this levelonly later.

568 General Discussion

569 This cross-sectional study examined the role of phonological recoding in the early stages 570 of reading development, using the pseudohomophone effect as a marker of automatic 571 phonological recoding. In contrast with previous studies, analyses only included words 572 for which an orthographic choice task or spelling task ensured that children actually knew 573 the spelling. As such, any pseudohomophone effect may be unambiguously related to 574 automatic phonological recoding. Furthermore, this allowed us to investigate whether children also use their orthographic knowledge optimally in a reading task such as 575 576 proofreading. In Experiment 1, children in grades 1, 2, and 3 detected more control 577 misspellings than pseudohomophone misspellings. This pseudohomophone effect was 578 more pronounced in grade 1 than it was in grade 2, but there was no difference between 579 grades 2 and 3. In Experiment 2, this decrease in phonological recoding effects as a 580 function of grade was replicated with children in grades 2, 3, and 4. Additionally, spelling 581 expertise modulated the strength of the pseudohomophone effect across grades. There 582 was no difference in the size of the pseudohomophone effect between more and less 583 advanced spellers in grade 2, while in grade 3, the pseudohomophone effect was much 584 stronger for less advanced than for more advanced spellers. From grade 3 on, more 585 advanced spellers already reached the same level as in grade 4, but less advanced spellers 586 reached this level only later.

587

It should be noted that the results of Experiments 1 and 2 differ with respect to the evolution of pseudohomophone effects. In Experiment 1, performance on pseudohomophones did not increase from grades 2 to 3, whereas it did in Experiment 2. This difference is likely to be due to the fact that the participants of Experiment 1 were already in the second term of the school year when being tested, while the subjects of Experiment 2 were in the first term. Thus, the children of the first experiment had already received more reading and spelling courses relative to the participants of Experiment 2 in

the same grade. Still, the pseudohomophone effect for children in Experiment 2

diminished from grade 3 to grade 4, but this was only the case for less advanced spellers.

595 596

597

598 Also note that performance on pseudohomophones increased gradually with grade (e.g., 599 Experiment 1: from .29 in grade 1 to .81 in grade 3), whereas performance on control 600 misspellings was high from grade 1 on (.84). These (near) ceiling effects for controls 601 follow naturally from the way children (and adults) process words and are present in most 602 other studies with similar research questions and similar designs (e.g., [19, 21, 23, 26]). A 603 control misspelling (e.g., geim for the base word geit 'goat') has no representation in 604 lexical memory, nor does it have the same pronunciation as an existing word, so that it is relatively easy to correctly mark this item as a misspelling, and this already from grade 1 605 on. The good performance on control misspellings shows that children knew the 606 607 orthographic word forms, and this was also confirmed in the orthographic choice and 608 spelling tests. The performance on pseudohomophones was lower than this overall spelling level indicating that children phonologically recoded the words (i.e., the 609 610 phonology of a pseudohomophone can activate the orthographic representation of its base

611 word, leading to an acceptance of the pseudohomophone as a correct word). The strict

612 matching procedure for pseudohomophones and control misspellings ensured that

613 phonological overlap with a word was the critical difference between pseudohomophones

614 and controls.

615

616 The present pattern of results in Dutch showing decreasing phonological recoding effects 617 during proofreading as a function of increasing reading proficiency is in agreement with 618 the results from previous studies on other languages (e.g., English: [16, 26]; French: [18, 619 23]). For instance, Sprenger-Charolles et al. [18] observed strong pseudohomophone 620 effects for beginning French readers in a semantic categorization task and these effects diminished from grade 3 onwards. Interestingly, the present pseudohomophone effect 621 622 already decreased from grade 1 onwards. This may indicate that Dutch readers develop 623 and use orthographic knowledge earlier in reading development than French readers and 624 is likely to be related to cross-language differences in orthographic consistency. This is in 625 accordance with the developmental model of Share [9] which states that the phonological 626 procedure provides the basic mechanism for acquiring word-specific orthographic 627 representations. However, note that task differences in Sprenger-Charolles et al. and the 628 present study and the fact that Sprenger-Charolles et al. did not remove unknown words 629 from the analyses may also contribute to the difference in results. Still, Grainger et al. 630 [23] also tested pseudohomophones and their pseudohomophone effects in beginning 631 readers are generally smaller than the ones found in Dutch. Although there are also task 632 differences present here, this may again indicate a somewhat stronger influence of 633 phonological recoding in early stages of Dutch reading.

634

635 Our cross-sectional results for Dutch supplement earlier results in Dutch language 636 research on the pseudohomophone effect by Bosman and de Groot [21] and the word 637 length effect by Martens and de Jong [34]. Not only did we replicate Bosman and de 638 Groot's pseudohomophone effect for first graders, we also observed a diminishing 639 pseudohomophone effect with increasing proficiency in Dutch. The pseudohomophone 640 effect decreased more slowly for children with less orthographic knowledge than for 641 children with more orthographic knowledge. In Bosman and de Groot's study, less 642 advanced readers showed stronger pseudohomophone effects than more advanced readers 643 at the end of grade 1, whereas we only observed such a difference at the beginning of 644 grade 3. There may be several reasons for this difference. First, there may be a difference 645 between groupings based on reading versus spelling knowledge. However, Bosman and de Groot reported a strong, significant correlation (r = .50) between reading and spelling 646 647 proficiency (see also [41]). Second, the strong pseudohomophone effect reported for 648 more advanced readers in Bosman and de Groot might not have been that strong if the 649 data were analyzed differently. They used an orthographic choice task in which children 650 have a 50% chance of choosing the correct response if they did not know the right answer. In addition, items for which children did not know the spelling were not filtered 651 652 out from the analyses. As the results of the orthographic choice task were weaker for less 653 advanced (M = .86) than for more advanced readers (M = .96), it might be that analyzing 654 the results in a different way tuned down the strong pseudohomophone effect difference 655 between more and less advanced readers.

656

657 The results are in accordance with reading acquisition accounts that assume an important 658 role for phonological recoding in beginning reading (e.g., [9-11]). It seems that in the 659 beginning of reading development, phonological recoding strongly affects children's 660 word reading, because even though a spelling test had shown that children had orthographic knowledge of the words, they still failed to reject pseudohomophone 661 662 misspellings. This suggests that they may not use their orthographic knowledge optimally 663 in a reading task such as proofreading and indicates the strong involvement of 664 phonological recoding. They face two conflicting responses: based on phonological 665 recoding, the pseudohomophone should be a word, whereas it should be a nonword based 666 on their orthographic knowledge. More experienced spellers and readers grow less 667 dependent on phonological recoding in their decision to mark misspellings. They

668 increasingly master consolidated word-specific orthographic knowledge and as a result,669 the more experienced spellers and readers can correctly reject pseudohomophones.

670 Bosman and de Groot [21] put forward spelling verification as the basic mechanism for 671 detecting misspellings. As discussed earlier, the verification hypothesis assumes that in 672 order to identify a pseudohomophone as a misspelling, readers compare their knowledge of the correct spelling with the spelling of the stimulus. In Bosman and de Groot's study, 673 674 effective spelling verification was positively related to reading skill, but the differential 675 performance of more advanced readers on for example proofreading lists versus stories 676 showed that spelling verification is not yet stable in beginning readers. Bosman and de 677 Groot assumed that the activation of phonology is a primary constraint in all tasks, but 678 that task context can add additional constraints that work against successful verification. 679 They also concluded that, based on their results with beginning readers and Van Orden 680 and colleagues' results [22,42] it may be legitimate to infer that phonological processing 681 underlies the reading of beginning and skilled readers alike. Phonological recoding 682 indeed has a long lasting influence on reading (e.g., [18]) and there is ample evidence that 683 phonological information is automatically activated in adult reading, both in reading in a 684 native language (e.g., [22, 43, 44, 45]; for a review of evidence supporting a strong 685 phonological theory, see [46]) and in reading in a second language [47]. For instance, in Sprenger-Charolles et al. [18], significant pseudohomophone effects were still observed 686 687 in grade 4. This last result is similar to the present results, for we observed that the 688 children in grades 3 and 4 still showed a small pseudohomophone effect. This means that 689 phonological recoding still has an influence in proofreading, even for these familiar 690 words for which they acquired sufficient orthographic knowledge as revealed by the 691 spelling test. It seems that phonological recoding and the use of orthographic whole-word 692 knowledge are interactive processes during reading.

who wheage are interactive processes during reading.

693 To conclude, the present results provide new insights into the development of

694 phonological recoding in Dutch readers. As such, it adds to the language variety in the

reading acquisition literature. Phonological recoding was found to have a significant

influence in error detection in first and second grade children, even for words for which it

697 was shown that children know the spelling. The effect of phonological recoding

698 diminished, but remained significant, as readers become more advanced.

699 Acknowledgments

The authors are grateful to the director, teachers, and children of the primary school inSint-Gillis-Waas (Belgium) for taking part in these studies.

702 **References**

703	1.	Coltheart M, Rastle K, Perry C, Langdon R, Ziegler J (2001) DRC: A dual route
704		cascaded model of visual word recognition and reading aloud. Psychol Rev 108:
705		204-256.
706	2.	Plaut DC, McClelland JL, Seidenberg MS, Patterson K (1996) Understanding
707		normal and impaired word reading: Computational principles in quasi-regular
708		domains. Psychol Rev 103: 56-115.
709	3.	Harm MW, Seidenberg, MS (2004) Computing the meanings of words in reading:
710		Cooperative division of labor between visual and phonological processes. Psychol
711		Rev 111: 662-720.
712	4.	Baron J (1977). Mechanisms for pronouncing printed words: Use and acquisition.
713		In LaBerge D & Samuels SJ, editors. Basis processes in reading: Perception and
714		comprehension. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum, pp.175-216.
715	5.	Coltheart M (2005) Modeling reading: The dual-route approach. In: Snowling MJ,
716		Hulme C, editors. The science of reading: A handbook. Oxford, England:
717		Blackwell. pp. 6-23.
718	6.	Ehri LC (1992) Reconceptualizing the development of sight word reading and its
719		relationship to recoding. In: Gough P L, Ehri LC, Treiman R, editors. Reading
720		acquisition. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc. pp. 107-143.
721	7.	Ehri LC (1998) Grapheme-phoneme knowledge is essential for learning to read
722		words in English. In: Metsala JL, Ehri LC, editors. Word recognition in beginning
723		literacy. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum. pp. 3-40.
724	8.	Ehri LC (2005) Learning to read words: Theory, findings, and issues. Sci Stud
725		Read 9: 167-188.
726	9.	Share DL (1995) Phonological recoding and self-teaching. Sine qua non of
727		reading acquisition. Cognition, 55, 151-218.
728	10	. Share DL (1999) Phonological recoding and orthographic learning: A direct test
729		of the self-teaching hypothesis. J Exp Child Psychol 72: 95-129.
730	11	. Share DL (2004) Orthographic learning at a glance: On the time course and
731		developmental onset of self-teaching. J Exp Child Psychol 87: 267-298.
732	12	. Firth I (1972) Components of reading disability. Unpublished doctoral
733		dissertation, University of New South Wales, Australia.
734	13	. Jorm AF, Share DL (1983) Phonological recoding and reading acquisition. Appl
735		Psycholinguist 4: 103-147.
736	14	. Share DL (2008) Orthographic learning, phonological recoding, and self-teaching.
737		In Kail R, editor. Advances in child development and behaviour. Amsterdam:
738		Elsevier. Vol. 36, pp. 31-82.
739	15	. Share DL (2008) On the Anglocentricities of current reading research and
740		practice: The perils of overreliance on an "outlier" orthography. Psychol Bull 134:
741		584- 615.
742	16	. Doctor E, Coltheart M (1980) Phonological recoding in children's reading for
743		meaning. Mem Cognit 80: 195-209.

744	17. Sprenger-Charolles L, Siegel LS, Béchennec D (1998) Phonological mediation
745	and semantic and orthographic factors in silent reading in French. Sci Stud Read
746	2: 3-29.
747	18. Sprenger-Charolles L, Siegel LS, Béchennec D, Serniclaes W (2003)
748	Development of phonological and orthographic processing in reading aloud, in
749	silent reading, and in spelling: A four-year longitudinal study. J Exp Child
750	Psychol 84: 194-217.
750 751	19. Goswami U, Ziegler JC, Dalton L, Schneider W (2001) Pseudohomophone effects
752	and phonological recoding procedures in reading development in English and
753	German. J Mem Lang 45: 648-664.
753 754	20. Wimmer H, Goswami U (1994) The influence of orthographic consistency on
755	reading development: Word recognition in English and German children.
756	Cognition 51: 91-103.
750 757	21. Bosman AMT, de Groot AMB (1996) Phonologic mediation is fundamental to
758	reading: Evidence from beginning readers. Q J Exp Psychol 49A: 715-744.
759	22. Van Orden GC (1987) A ROWS is a ROSE: Spelling, sound, and reading. Mem
760	Cognit 15: 181-198.
760 761	23. Grainger J, Lété B, Bertand D, Dufau S, Ziegler JC (2012) Evidence for multiple
762	routes in learning to read. Cognition 123: 280-292.
762	
763 764	24. Coltheart V, Laxon V, Rickard M, Elton C (1988) Phonological recoding in reading for meaning by adults and children. J Exp Psychol Learn Mem Cogn 14:
764 765	387-397.
765 766	
	25. Jared D, Levy BA, Rayner K (1999) The role of phonology in the activation of
767 768	word meanings during reading: Evidence from proofreading and eye movements.
768 769	J Exp Psychol Gen 3: 219-264.
	26. Johnston RS, Thompson GB, Fletcher-Flinn CM, Holligan C (1995) The
770 771	functions of phonology in the acquisition of reading: Lexical sentence processing.
772	Mem Cognit 23: 749-766.
	27. Kyte CS, Johnson CJ (2006) The role of phonological recoding in orthographic learning. J Exp Child Psychol 93: 166-185.
773 774	28. Starr MS, Fleming KK (2001) A rose by any other name is not the same: The role
775	
776	of orthographic knowledge in homophone confusion errors. J Exp Psychol Learn Mem Cogn 27: 744-760.
777	29. Chomsky N, Halle M (1968) The sound pattern of English. New York: Harper
778	and Row. 470 p.
779	30. Bosman AMT, Vonk W, van Zwam M (2006) Spelling consistency affects
779 780	reading in young Dutch readers with and without dyslexia. Ann Dyslexia 56: 271-
780 781	300.
781	31. Bosman AMT, de Graaff S, Gijsel MAR (2006) Double Dutch: The Dutch
782 783	spelling system and learning to spell in Dutch. In: Joshi RM, Aaron PG, editors.
783 784	Handbook of Orthography and Literacy. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum
785	Associates. pp. 135-150.
785	32. Reitsma P (1983) Printed word learning in beginning readers. J Exp Child
780 787	Psychol 36: 321-339.
787 788	33. Reitsma P (1983) Word-specific knowledge in beginning reading. J Res Read 6:
788 789	41-56.
107	T1-JU.

790 791	34. Martens VEG, de Jong PF (2006) The effect of word length on lexical decision in dyslexic and normal reading children. Brain Lang 98: 140-149.
792	35. Becker CA (1976) Allocation of attention during visual word recognition. J Exp
793	Psychol Hum Percept Perform 2: 556-566.
794	36. Davelaar E, Coltheart M, Besner D, Jonasson JT (1978) Phonological recoding
795	and lexical access. Mem Cognit 6: 391-402.
796	37. Ziegler JC, Goswami U (2005) Reading acquisition, developmental dyslexia, and
797	skilled reading across languages: A psycholinguistic grain size theory. Psychol
798	Bull 131: 3-29.
799	38. Coltheart M, Davelaar E, Jonasson JT, Besner D (1977) Access to the internal
800	lexicon. In: Dornic S, editor. Attention and Performance VI. New York:
801	Academia Press. pp. 535-555.
802	39. Duyck W, Desmet T, Verbeke LPC, Brysbaert M (2004) Wordgen: A tool for
803	word selection and nonword generation in Dutch, English, German and French.
804	Behav Res Methods Instrum Comput 36: 488-499.
805	40. Baayen R, Piepenbrock R, Van Rijn H (1993) The CELEX lexical database. [CD
806	ROM]. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania: Linguistic Data Consortium.
807	41. Ehri LC, Wilce LS (1987) Does learning to spell help beginners learn to read
808	words? Read Res Q 22: 47-65.
809	42. Van Orden GC, Stone GO, Garlington KL, Markson LR, Pintt GS, et al. (1992)
810	"Assembled" phonology and reading: A case study in how theoretical perspective
811	shapes empirical investigation. In Frost R, Katz L, editors. Orthography,
812	phonology, morphology, and meaning. Amsterdam: Elsevier Science Publishers
813	B. V. pp. 249-292.
814	43. Van Orden GC, Johnston JC, Halle BL (1988) Word identification in reading
815	proceeds from spelling to sound to meaning. J Exp Psychol Learn Mem Cogn 14:
816	371-386.
817	44. Ashby J (2010) Phonology is fundamental in skilled reading: Evidence from
818	ERPs. Psychon B Rev 17: 95-100.
819	45. Ashby J, Rayner K (2004) Representing syllable information during silent
820	reading: Evidence from eye movements. Lang Cognit Process 19: 391-426.
821	46. Frost R (1998) Toward a strong phonological theory of visual word recognition:
822	True issues and false trails. Psychol Bull 123: 71-99.
823	47. Duyck W (2005) Translation and associative priming with cross-lingual
824	pseudohomophones: Evidence for nonselective phonological activation in
825	bilinguals. J Exp Psychol Learn Mem Cogn 31: 1340-1359.
826	

827 Figure Legends

- Figure 1. Mean proportion correctly classified pseudohomophone and control
 misspellings as a function of Grade in Experiment 1.
- Footnote. Error bars show standard errors. Proportions are based on 6 items percondition.
- 832
- 833 Figure 2. Mean proportion correctly spelled base words for less and more advanced
- 834 spellers as a function of Grade in Experiment 2.

- Footnote. Error bars show standard errors. Proportions are based on 12 items per
- 836 condition.
- 837
- Figure 3. Mean proportion correctly classified pseudohomophone and control
 misspellings as a function of Grade in Experiment 2.
- 840 Footnote. Error bars show standard errors. Proportions are based on 12 items per
- 841 condition.

842 Tables

- 843 Table 1. Examples of the phoneme-to-grapheme mappings of the selected base words.
- 844

Sound	Letters	Examples
[x]	g, ch	weg (road), nacht (night)
[ɛi]	ij, ei	wijn (wine), kijkt (he looks), klein (small), geit (goat)
[t]	t, d	hoed (hat), koud (cold),
[Au]	ou, auw	blauw (blue), kous (sock), zout (salt)
[f]	v, f	geeft (he gives)

845